



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

<b>Effective Date:</b> 5/1/2019	<b>Document #:</b> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039	<b>Revision Date:</b> 1/18/2022	<b>Revision#:</b> 1
------------------------------------	--	------------------------------------	------------------------

<b>Document Title:</b> Procurement Board Report-RFP	<b>Document Owner/Department:</b> Procurement Team
--	---

**Date: July 19, 2022**  
**To: Suzanne R. Coffey, P.E., Chief Executive Officer**  
**From: Daniel Edwards, Procurement Manager**  
**Re: Procurement Report**

General Information			
Contract Number:	2100239	Project Owner:	Alfredo Lava
Contract Title:	Water Resource Recovery Facilities Structural Evaluation and Repairs		
Vendor:	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.		
Budget:	Capital Project		

Procurement Method			
Competitively bid – Request for Proposal (RFP) Qualification Based Selection (QBS) – Evaluation Committee			
Advertised:	1/26/22	Addendums released:	4
Buyer:	Kimberly Bennett-Ruffin	Downloaded by:	71
Response due date:	3/18/22	Responses received:	3

Cost Summary – Kokosing Industrial, Inc.		
Description	Proposed Cost	Negotiated Cost
<b>Task 1 - PROJECT MANAGEMENT</b>		
1.1 - Project Management	\$1,394,000.00	\$1,394,000.00
<b>Task 2 - CONDITION ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING</b>		
2.1 - Engineering Assessment, Clarifier Tank 17 and 18	21,000.00	21,000.00
2.2 – Engineering Assessment, Complex A Thickener Tanks 1 - 6	32,000.00	32,000.00
2.3 - Engineering Assessment, Complex B Thickener Tanks 9 – 14 and Pipe Gallery	32,000.00	32,000.00
2.4 - Engineering Assessment, Complex A Sludge Storage Tanks 1 – 6	23,000.00	23,000.00
2.5 – Engineering Assessment, B-Houses: 4, 9, 17, 23, and 30	23,000.00	23,000.00
2.6 – Engineering Assessment, Administration Building (Old and New)	26,000.00	26,000.00



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

2.7 – Engineering Assessment, Aeration Facility	32,000.00	32,000.00
2.8 – Engineering Assessment, Chlorination and Dechlorination Structure	18,000.00	18,000.00
<b>Task 3 – FINAL DESIGN AND PERMITTING</b>		
3.1 – Engineering Repair Design, Clarifier Tanks 17 and 18	20,000.00	20,000.00
3.2 – Engineering Repair Design, Complex A Thickener Tanks 1 – 6	46,500.00	46,500.00
3.3 - Engineering Repair Design, Complex B Thickener Tanks 9 – 14 and Pipe Gallery	46,500.00	46,500.00
3.4 - Engineering Repair Design, Complex A Sludge Storage Tanks 1 – 6	25,500.00	25,500.00
3.5 - Engineering Repair Design, B-Houses: 4, 9, 17, 23, and 30	25,500.00	25,500.00
3.6 – Engineering Repair Design, Administration Building (Old and New)	31,500.00	31,500.00
3.7 - Engineering Repair Design, Aeration Facility	46,500.00	46,500.00
3.8 - Engineering Repair Design, Chlorination and Dechlorination Structure	13,500.00	13,500.00
<b>Task 4 - CONSTRUCTION</b>		
4.1 – Pre-Inspection Tank Cleaning and Power Wash Clarifier Tanks # 17 and 18	88,000.00	88,000.00
4.2 – Pre-Inspection Tank Cleaning Complex A Thickener Tanks # 1 – 6	126,000.00	126,000.00
4.3 – Pre-Inspection Tank Cleaning Complex B Thickener Tanks # 9 – 14	126,000.00	126,000.00
4.4 – Pre-Inspection Tank Cleaning, Power Wash, and Pumping Complex A Sludge Storage Tanks # 1 – 6	96,000.00	96,000.00
4.5 – Drive Bridge Recoating of Steel Structure, per the Specifications, Section 09960 – “High Performance Coatings”, Paragraphs 2.2.03 and 2.3.04 – “Edge Retentive System, “(including Incidental Weld Repairs)	534,000.00	534,000.00
4.6 – Internal Tank, Concrete Repair, Rout and Seal Cracks/Fractures	13,500.00	13,500.00
4.7 – Internal Tank Floor (Concrete Surface Repairs) Depth: 0” – 2”	94,500.00	94,500.00
4.8 – Internal Tank Floor (Concrete Surface Repairs) Depth: > 2”	63,050.00	63,050.00
4.9 – Internal Tank Walls (Concrete Surface Repairs)	97,500.00	97,500.00



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

Depth: 0" – 2"		
4.10 – Internal Tank Walls (Concrete Surface Repairs) Depth: > 2"	132,000.00	132,000.00
4.11 – Internal Tank Walls and Floor Supplemental Steel Reinforcement at Concrete Repairs	25,200.00	25,200.00
4.12 – Coating Repairs Concrete, per the Specifications, Section 09900 – “Painting”, 2.2.12 – “Concrete Building Walls, Interior”	13,800.00	13,800.00
4.13 – Coating Repairs Concrete Masonry Units (CMU) per the Specifications, Section 09900 – “Painting”, 2.2.13 – Concrete Block Masonry, Interior	10,000.00	10,000.00
4.14 – Concrete Repair, Rout and Seal Cracks/Fractures	23,375.00	23,375.00
4.15 – Concrete Surface Repairs, Depth: 0" – 2"	67,200.00	67,200.00
4.16 – Concrete Surface Repairs, Depth: > 2"	53,350.00	53,350.00
4.17 – Supplemental Steel Reinforcement at Concrete Repairs	6,660.00	6,660.00
4.18 – Drywall, Cracks, Sand, Tape, and Mud	30,000.00	30,000.00
4.19 – Drywall and Painting	20,000.00	20,000.00
4.20 – Interior CMU, Cracked or Missing Mortar and Flexible Sealant Repair	40,300.00	40,300.00
4-21 - Interior CMU, Cracked or Missing Mortar and re-tuck-pointing	70,250.00	70,250.00
4-22 – Interior CMU, Expansion Joint and Sealant Replacement	16,400.00	16,400.00
4-23 – Interior CMU, Block Broken, Replacement	1,917.00	1,917.00
4-24 – Leak Sealing, Chemical Grout, Concrete Cracks and Joints	72,485.00	72,485.00
4-25 – Coating Repairs, Concrete, per the Specifications, 09960 – “High Performance Coatings” Paragraphs 2.2.02, 2.3.02, and 2.3.03 – “Wear Resistant System”	32,500.00	32,500.00
4-26 – Coating Concrete, Non-Slip Deck Coating, per the Specifications, Section 09960 – “High Performance Coatings” Paragraph 2.2.02, 2.3.02, and 2.3.03 – “Wear Resistant System”	814,000.00	814,000.00
4-27 – Concrete Repair, Rout and Seal Cracks/Fractures	87,100.00	87,100.00
4-28 – Concrete Stairs, Embedded Nosing, Replacement	43,200.00	43,200.00
4-29 – Exterior Brick, Control Joints, Sealant Replacement	69,700.00	69,700.00
4-30 – Exterior Brick, Cracked/Missing Mortar, Re-tuck	180,000.00	180,000.00



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

Pointing		
4-31 – Exterior Brick, Missing/Broken, Replacement	4,750.00	4,750.00
4-32 – Exterior, Concrete Sidewalk Slab Replacement	46,125.00	46,125.00
4-33 – Exterior, Concrete Surface Repairs, Depth: 0” – 2”	83,200.00	83,200.00
4-34 – Exterior, C-3oncrete Surface Repairs, Depth: > 2”	75,900.00	75,900.00
4-35 – Exterior, Supplemental Steel Reinforcement at Concrete Repairs	10,620.00	10,620.00
4-36 – Exterior, Concrete, Control Joint Sealant, Replacement	28,000.00	28,000.00
4-37 – Exterior, Concrete, and Curbs	61,000.00	61,000.00
4-38 – Exterior Roof Gutter Repair	15,000.00	15,000.00
4-39 – Exterior Platforms Steel Recoating, per the Specifications, Section 09900 – “Painting”, Paragraph 2.2.02 – “Ferrous Metal Surfaces, Exterior, Non-submerged	146,000.00	146,000.00
4-40 – Exterior Stairs Steel Recoating, per the Specifications 09900 – “Painting”, Paragraph 2.2.02 – “Ferrous Metal Surfaces, Exterior, Non-submerged”	92,600.00	92,600.00
4-41 – Exterior Handrail Steel Recoating, per the Specifications 09900 – “Painting”, Paragraph 2.2.02 – “Ferrous Metal Surfaces, Exterior Non-submerged”	6,660.00	6,660.00
4-42 – Handrail Post Attachment (Replacement)	620,000.00	620,000.00
4-43 – Handrail Repair	7,000.00	7,000.00
4-44 – Handrail Replacement	38,400.00	38,400.00
4-45 – Isolation/Cove Joint Sealant (Replacement)	87,935.00	87,935.00
4-46 – Leak Sealing, Chemical Grout, Conduit Bundle Penetrations through Pipe Gallery Roof Slab	16,800.00	16,800.00
4-47 – Exterior Side of Tank Wall Leak Sealing, Chemical Grout	28,885.00	28,885.00
4-48 – Leak Sealing, Replace Tank to Roof Slab Curb Joint/Sealant	21,930.00	21,930.00
4-49 – Shrub and Plant Growth, Removal	2,300.00	2,300.00
4-50 – Window and Door Lintel Coating, per the Specifications, Section 09900 – “Painting”, paragraph 2.2.02 – “Ferrous Metal Surface, Exterior, Non-submerged”	11,165.00	11,165.00
4-51 – Window and Door Sealant, Replacement	28,000.00	28,000.00
4-52 – Construction Mobilization and Demobilization	220,000.00	220,000.00
4-53 – Construction Phase Engineering Services	630,000.00	630,000.00



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

4-54 – Non-Manual Labor, General Conditions, and all other Costs	3,232,243.00	3,232,243.00
<b>Task 5 – Re-caulk Administrative Building (Old and New)</b>		
5.1 – Remove Exterior Caulk, Prepare, Prime and Re-caulk Administration Building (Old and New)	170,000.00	170,000.00
<b>Task 6 – As-constructed Documents, Document Management, Records Turnover and Close-out Documents</b>		
6.1 – As-constructed Documents, Document Management, Records Turnover and Close-out Report	50,000.00	50,000.00
<b>Provisional Allowance</b>		
7.1 – Provisional Allowance	2,000,000.00	2,000,000.00
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$12,639,000.00</b>	<b>\$12,639,000.00</b>

The scoring for this project was composed of both the technical qualifications and the price for both engineering and the construction phases of the work. The Kokosing team scored the highest of the three teams based on the technical qualifications. The response included items above and beyond the scope of work that was included within the RFP documents, and those items are being included in the Contract Scope of Work, indicating a value add to their proposal. During negotiations, Kokosing also waived several of their exclusions without an adjustment in the price.

The proposed pricing provided by Kokosing was 2<sup>nd</sup> low of the three prices and was only 0.1% higher than the low price. The third bid was only 5.7% higher than the low bid. The bid table was reviewed for anomalies, and none were found. Due to the cost being scored as part of the evaluation criteria (40 points), the proximity of Kokosing to the lowest price, and the overall consistency in the pricing received between all three proposers, the evaluation team determined that negotiations were not required.

*Provisionary Allowance is an amount included in the Contract Price to reimburse the Contractor for the cost to furnish and perform Work that is uncertain. Any remaining balance upon Final Completion shall be retained by the GLWA and not paid to the Contractor.*

Benchmarking was completed by comparing the proposals for this project. This analysis confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated in the attached cost tabulation.

**Evaluation Committee: (Designation – Organization)**

A – GLWA Engineer



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

B – GLWA Team Leader

C – AECOM Consultant

**Evaluation Score(s)** - Maximum Score Possible: 100

*The Evaluation Committee independently reviewed and scored the proposals in accordance with GLWA's policy. The rankings are below.*

Vendor (Highest to lowest score)	Score without B.I.D.	Score with B.I.D.
<b>Kokosing Industrial, Inc.</b>	<b>90.14</b>	<b>92.14</b>
<b>Commercial Contracting Corporation</b>	<b>85.68</b>	<b>88.68</b>
<b>Pullman SST, Inc.</b>	<b>84.14</b>	<b>87.14</b>

Vendor Name	B.I.D. Plan (Pass/Fail)	Score w/o B.I.D.	State of Michigan (1 pt.)	GLWA Territory Area (1 pt.)	Economically Disadvantaged Territory (1 pt.)	Score w/B.I.D.	Certifications
Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Pass	90.14	1	1	0	92.14	Yes
Commercial Contracting Corporation	Pass	85.68	1	1	1	88.68	Yes
Pullman SST, Inc.	Pass	84.14	1	1	1	87.14	Yes

**Business Inclusion and Diversity (B.I.D.)**

B.I.D. program required                       B.I.D. program not required

The recommended vendor for award submitted a B.I.D. plan per the requirements under this solicitation.

The recommended vendor for award did not submit a B.I.D. plan per the requirements under this solicitation.

The vendor received points for the following scored criteria:

Business presence in State of Michigan

Business presence in GLWA service territory area (list the territory)

Business presence in economically disadvantaged GLWA service territory area (list the territory)



**Procurement Form (FOR)**

**Effective Date:**  
5/1/2019

**Document #:**  
FSA\_PRO\_FOR\_0039

**Revision Date:**  
1/18/2022

**Revision#:**  
1

**Document Title:**  
Procurement Board Report-RFP

**Document Owner/Department:**  
Procurement Team

**Other Data Requested by GLWA Board Members for Recommended Vendor**

Minority Business Enterprise (MBE): No  
Small Business Enterprise (SBE): No  
Woman Business Enterprise (WBE): No  
Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE): No  
Detroit Based Business (DBB): No  
Other:

Sub-Contractor(s) List:  
Osborn Engineering  
D.C. Byer  
Murray Painting

Vendor Response Survey: N/A

**Litigation**

This vendor is not currently nor has been previously involved in any litigation with the GLWA.

**Financials**

A financial risk assessment was performed by the GLWA via Dun & Bradstreet and was determined that the selected vendor has the financial capacity to perform the tasks under this contract. This information is available for the Board of Directors to review upon request.

**Previous Contract**

Previous contract holder: N/A